

I. Welcome and Introductions

Brett Banks (GSA) welcomed the group to the third consulting party meeting.

Nancy Witherell (GSA) reviewed the schedule of the Section 106 consulting party meetings. Two previous meetings have been held. The first meeting provided an introduction to the project and the second was a tour of the Old Post Office (OPO) building. Today's meeting addresses the exterior of the building and the surrounding site. The fourth meeting will be held on Wednesday, September 19th to review the interior of the OPO.

Brett Banks (GSA) reviewed the goals as stated in the proposal. The Old Post Office will be a ground lease with improvements.

Group: All attendees introduced themselves.

II. Presentation

Ivanka Trump (The Trump Organization) reviewed the importance of the GSA proposal goals and restated the additional goals of the Trump Organization – to create the finest luxury hotel in the world; create the largest luxury ballroom space in Washington, DC; preserve and restore the fabric of the OPO building; remove non-contributing elements in the OPO; create an enhanced and enriched route for the public through the building to the museum and tower and obtain LEED certification. Ms. Trump also informed the group that Arthur Cotton Moore has taken a medical leave of absence.

John Cullinane (John Cullinane Architect, LLC) reviewed the history of the OPO, importance of location and context, and the exterior elements. The shape and form of the building help to determine the contributing historical elements. The cortile was designed for function to allow natural light into the center of the building. The architectural style is Richardsonian Romanesque, characterized by heavy stone arches, turrets and stone detailing. The main materials of the OPO include granite, slate, copper and cast iron. GSA has done well with replacement in kind where repairs are needed. Repairs have been done to the copper and slate roof. The built-up (flat) roof will need to be removed and replaced. Very little repair is needed for the stone and mortar. Cleaning of the façade was done approximately 5 years ago by the GSA so a full scale cleaning is not intended or needed. The windows are mostly original (except the 8th floor) and will need repair. All of the exterior doors were replaced in the 1980s renovation. The project is primarily a rehabilitation of the exterior. A chart within the report outlines the primary exterior contributing elements.

John reviewed the main points of the project proposal. The proposed design highlights Pennsylvania Avenue as the primary pedestrian access into the hotel. 11th Street will be

Old Post Office

Consulting Party Meeting Meeting Notes

July 25, 2012
GSA Regional Office Building
1:30 – 4:00 pm

reopened at the Avenue, and will provide vehicular and pedestrian access to the hotel lobby and parking garage as well as pedestrian access and handicap ramp access to the lower level. 12th Street will be a pedestrian entrance and the southern entrance will be designed to welcome pedestrians visiting the bell tower and museum. Canopies will mark the Pennsylvania Avenue entrance, the 11th Street and the Annex entrances. The canopies will be freestanding and will not be physically appended to the building structure.

The service, loading and mechanical support for the hotel will be accommodated through the Annex building. The existing connection between the main building and the Annex contains utilities and a service loading corridor at the lower level, in addition to patron access to the ballroom and function spaces at the OPO First Floor level. The Annex will also house a 150 car parking garage, conference rooms and ballroom functions.

Andrew Lewis (DCSHPO) asked if the window (presentation page 25) at the left had been replaced. John Cullinane responded he was not sure and would look at it.

Jeff Lee (Lee and Associates, Inc.) reviewed the existing and proposed site and landscape plan for the OPO. Pennsylvania Avenue is intended to remain as is with the exception of paver replacement where needed and new programmatic functions to enliven the streetscape. New site features along Pennsylvania Avenue will be temporary elements such as the café seating, seating perimeter and café signs. The curb cut at Pennsylvania Avenue will be restored, to enter the 11th Street drive. The 11th Street drive will serve as the main guest entry and drop-off for the hotel and will most likely be paved with a material such as granite pavers. The Annex roof will have an extensive green roof (sedum and adaptable plantings) surrounding a more detailed roof garden and gathering space. 12th Street sidewalk is presently an exposed aggregate paving in good condition. This will be retained to the extent possible except for additional planting space as needed. The C Street Plaza scale will change with the removal of the 1980's glass structure and bike rental facility. This area will become the primary public entrance into the OPO at the ground floor for those who want to access the bell tower and museum. A wide ramp will accommodate handicap access along terraces that step down to the main plaza space. The service drive will be maintained, but a retaining wall will be needed to accommodate the grade change.

Andrew Lewis (DCSHPO) It has been suggested that the PADC paving pattern at the entrance on Pennsylvania Avenue has some significance.

Nancy Witherell (GSA) We have contacted NPS, the successor agency to PADC for jurisdiction of the Penn Ave sidewalk, and NPS said it could find no record in its files of any commitments or agreements made by PADC to the artist for retention of the work in situ.

Jeff Lee (LAI) The intention of the proposed design is to maintain the existing wave paving pattern.

Dick Moore (IRS) Will there be mechanical systems on the Annex roof?

Durwood Dixon (WDG) Yes, there is existing mechanical equipment on the Annex roof and there will be mechanical equipment in the new design.

Lisa Lee (IRS Security) Is the parking only located on the lower level of the Annex?

Jeff Lee (LAI) responded yes.

David Maloney (DCSHPO) How does the C Street Plaza echo the gesture of the Federal Triangle?

Jeff Lee (LAI) The radial pattern permeates into the plaza as the ramp, landing and assembly area before entering the building. Café seating will occupy the terraces and plaza. The grade drop is approximately 5'. An approximately 3'-6" hedge with bollards or railing would provide a barrier to protect pedestrians from the service vehicles. Green screens will be added at the Annex and the Annex roof. The signage for the project will be located at the canopies, an entry sign wall on 11th and C streets and freestanding restaurant signage. No signage will be attached to the building.

III. Comment and Questions

Ellen McCarthy (Arent Fox) introduced herself as moderator and asked participants to focus their questions to the Section 106 process.

Rebecca Miller (DC Preservation League) Are you still pursuing tax credits?

Ivanka Trump (The Trump Organization) Yes.

Sarah Batcheler (CFA) There isn't too much to object to with the rehabilitation of the building exterior. At 11th Street, more permeability is important - making connections through and around the building and Annex. The canopies do not seem to go well with the building.

Ivanka Trump (The Trump Organization) We appreciate that comment. There are practical constraints to access around the building.

Sarah Batcheler (CFA) Allowing the façade of the OPO and Annex to come down to the ground would be a good gesture. CFA would support the development of a strengthened connection between the Annex and the building – an actual way to get from 11th Street to C

Old Post Office

Consulting Party Meeting Meeting Notes

July 25, 2012
GSA Regional Office Building
1:30 – 4:00 pm

Street. Engineering studies should be explored more vigorously to allow for some sort of grade connection.

David Orowitz (The Trump Organization) We need the building and Annex to operate as one. The service area needs to be separated and enclosed. We need to maintain the building as connected to make the building function.

Frederick Lindstrom (CFA) Pedestrian permeability is important. (Slide 49) Is there a subbasement level?

John Cullinane (John Cullinane Architect, LLC) There are only pockets, not a complete subbasement level.

Ivanka Trump (The Trump Organization) We are very concerned about permeability; it appears that most of the members of the public that are coming to access the bell tower are coming from the Mall or the Metro entrance here, and the proposed design provides them the opportunity to directly access the route to the tower by the C Street entrance. Going through the building is better than figuring out your way around the building by the service and loading area.

Frederick Lindstrom (CFA) The current design obscures the IRS arcade. The feature wall creates a dead-end and separates the arcade from the Hemi-cycle across 12th Street. This area is not working well. You don't need such a substantial separation of the vehicles from the people; mixing people and cars will add vitality. The design needs to be cleverer.

Jeff Lee (LAI) With the hotel function, the service area will have more traffic than now.

Ivanka Trump (The Trump Organization) You think we should do less to separate the service lane?

Frederick Lindstrom (CFA) Yes, mark the lane but it is ok to mix vehicles and pedestrians.

Joshua Seidner (The Trump Organization) We will explore connections and see if we can create a visual connection.

Frederick Lindstrom (CFA) See if you can solve the problem. The arcade is open – make it a part of the space. The canopies look like something from a funeral home. We can do something much better than a fabric canopy. They could be glass or metal, tasteful, contemporary. Hope you are not planning to demarcate the café seating areas with planters. Come up with something more tasteful, and interesting.

Ellen McCarthy (Arent Fox) Do you have something in mind?

Old Post Office

Consulting Party Meeting Meeting Notes

July 25, 2012
GSA Regional Office Building
1:30 – 4:00 pm

Frederick Lindstrom (CFA) Most of what I have seen is bad. I can't say that I've seen anything interesting. Think about setting a tone or character.

Ivanka Trump (The Trump Organization) If there is anything that comes to mind, please let us know.

Frederick Lindstrom (CFA) It could be something very elegant. With regard to the Annex, something better could also be done with the green screen. Is there access to the IRS courtyard / 10th Street from the Annex?

David Orowitz (The Trump Organization) The use of the Annex does not allow for access. That is an emergency exit only from the ballroom.

Lisa Lee (IRS) We would not permit public access to the IRS building.

Josh Seidner (The Trump Organization) It could be studied to allow for light.

Frederick Lindstrom (CFA) GSA did a study on permeability through the Federal Triangle.

Shane Dettman (NCPC) We would encourage re-study on the need for 11th Street and whether it is absolutely necessary to terminate in a vehicular cul-de-sac. The space between OPO and IRS could be an amazing forecourt for the hotel. Have you thought about non-vehicular access from metro? What impacts would a valet drop off on 12th Street or a lay by for drop-off on Pennsylvania Avenue bring? How much study went into pick-up and drop-off on Pennsylvania Avenue? Can we see your study? Has relocation of the Ben Franklin statue been considered and use the area for a fountain or new building signage?

Nancy Witherell (GSA) David Maloney and I nixed relocating the Ben Franklin statue.

Shane Dettman (NCPC) We've already received emails objecting to a curb cut on Pennsylvania Avenue.

Ellen McCarthy (Arent Fox) Isn't it essentially reopening a L'Enfant Street?

Shane Dettman (NCPC) It is not, it is a curb-cut for a driveway.

Andrew Lewis (DCSHPO) We would endorse an open street as much as possible to C Street even if it is only pedestrian. Overall, the proposed exterior treatments would likely have no adverse effect. We would be interested in learning more about the proposed skylights and the visual effects. Has the building been damaged by the earthquake or does it require any reinforcing?

Brett Banks (GSA) GSA did a study and did not find any damage.

Old Post Office

**Consulting Party Meeting
Meeting Notes**

**July 25, 2012
GSA Regional Office Building
1:30 – 4:00 pm**

John Cullinane (John Cullinane Architect, LLC) We will be doing a structural review, but so far we have not seen any damage.

Andrew Lewis (DCSHPO) Rather than listing the contributing elements individually, It may be simpler to state what is not a contributing element.

Nancy Witherell (GSA) Shane, can you clarify about the lay-by or drop off on Pennsylvania Avenue?

Shane Dettman (NCPC) An area where you can pull in or drop off.

Jeff Lee (LAI) We felt that would be impossible.

Sarah Batcheler (CFA) It would be helpful to know what was considered and discarded.

Shane Dettman (NCPC) If programmatically the need for a vehicular drop off on 11th street could be sacrificed, that should be reconsidered.

David Orowitz (The Trump Organization) We did give it consideration.

Shane Dettman (NCPC) It would be helpful for you to show what was considered but discarded for alternative drop-off locations and explain rationale.

Sarah Batcheler (CFA) I hope the green screen is not really an option. This is an urban environment and it is inappropriate to the setting.

Stephen Campbell (DCDGS) I have a question about the accessibility and permeability on all sides of the OPO. Is there greater ADA access in the proposed scheme?

John Cullinane (John Cullinane Architect, LLC) The 11th Street access would remain. The C Street Plaza would allow ADA access to the ground floor.

David Orowitz (The Trump Organization) The public will enter and be able to directly access to the clock tower on the ground level. That is also the level of other retail.

David Maloney (DC SHPO) My thoughts are aligned with the CFA and NCPC comments on the 11th Street corridor. It is important to remember that the Annex was designed to be a connection between the OPO and the IRS.

Lisa Lee (IRS Security) The IRS would not prefer open access. Visual could be ok, but we would not advocate for a connection between 10th Street and the Annex to the OPO.

David Maloney (DC SHPO) If that is the case, then it is even more important to create the 11th to C Street connection. Many policy documents have indicated the need to make Federal Triangle more permeable. GSA needs to indicate that this has been studied.

Old Post Office

**Consulting Party Meeting
Meeting Notes**

**July 25, 2012
GSA Regional Office Building
1:30 – 4:00 pm**

David Orowitz (The Trump Organization) We see the OPO building and the Annex function as a single building and we need to make the access between the OPO and the Annex work for service and guest functions. We do not believe there is an elegant solution to provide a physical connection from 11th to C Streets.

David Maloney (DC SHPO) I do not understand and it is GSA's obligation to look at alternatives.

Louise Brodnitz (ACHP) From a S106 point of view, we want to see the setting addressed. While the building is getting a white glove treatment, the setting of the building seems to be suburbanized. The vehicular access is making the OPO an island. There isn't any ADA access to the hotel. We need to see alternatives that address the concerns and comments.

Joshua Seidner (The Trump Organization) The primary handicapped access is at 11th Street, where it is today.

Louise Brodnitz (ACHP) Vehicles should not be the priority. Pedestrians should be the priority and the setting should be urban.

Andrew Weiss (The Trump Organization) We have studied the options carefully. This site has many constraints that we have inherited, and we cannot fix all of the constraints, but we do expect to make things better. We expect to have a vibrant hotel with many visitors. We gave deference to Pennsylvania Avenue pedestrians and separated the hotel guests and their luggage by moving them to 11th Street.

Ellen McCarthy (ArentFox) We understand that we need to show the thought process.

Murat Omay (DC DDOT) We did ask for alternatives and pedestrian and vehicular studies and will evaluate the alternatives.

Joshua Seidner (The Trump Organization) Studies were done. We wanted to enhance the entrance and the experience for visitors to the clock tower. Making the primary vehicular access at C Street would interfere with that.

Brett Banks (GSA) We will show the alternatives.

Sarah Batcheler (CFA) There are certain processes to meet, but we are here to be a partner, and we want to work with you to resolve things successfully

Jamie Keller (NPS) We must be aware of the vehicular impact on pedestrian safety.

Ellen McCarthy (ArentFox) Any other comments?

Old Post Office

**Consulting Party Meeting
Meeting Notes**

**July 25, 2012
GSA Regional Office Building
1:30 – 4:00 pm**

Brett Banks (GSA) We are close on completion of the Historic Structures Report. We are working on a website. Please see the agenda for dates moving forward. We are looking at Sept 19th for the next CP meeting.

Frederick Lindstrom (CFA) The morning of the 19th would be better.

Brett Banks (GSA) We will reach out to establish dates for further review.

Old Post Office

Consulting Party Meeting Meeting Notes

July 25, 2012
GSA Regional Office Building
1:30 – 4:00 pm

Sign-In Sheet

7/25	First Name	Last Name	Organization	Phone	Email
X	Brett	Banks	GSA	202-538-5642	brett.banks@gsa.gov
X	Sarah	Batcheler	CFA	202-504-2200	sbatcheler@cfa.gov
X	Danielle	Breaux	GSA	202-288-1298	daniellebreaux@turkadvisory.com
X	Louise	Brodnitz	ACHP	202-606-8527	lbrodnitz@achp.gov
X	Stephen	Campbell	DCDGS	202-671-2319	stephen.campbell@dc.gov
X	Rhonda	Dahlkemper	Lee & Assoc		
X	Stephen	Dalton	Dalton	202-309-3945	
X	Paula	Demuth	GSA	202-708-9870	Paula.demuth@gsa.gov
X	Shane	Dettman	NCPC	202-482-7267	shane.dettman@ncpc.gov
X	Durwood	Dixon	WDG		ddixon@wdgarch.com
X	Alan	Harwood	AECOM	703-739-4747	Alan.harwood@aecom.com
X	Jennifer	Hirsch	NCPC		jennifer.hirsch@ncpc.gov
X	Jamie	Keller	NPS		Jamie_keller@nps.gov
X	Saadat	Khan	DDOT/IDMA	202-671-2231	saadat.chan@dc.gov
X	Kirsten	Kulis	ACHP		kkulis@achp.gov
X	Taylor	Larsen	GSA	202-329-3679	Taylor.larsen@gsa.gov
X	Jeff	Lee	Lee & Assoc	202-466-6666	jlee@leeandassociatesinc.com
X	Lisa	Lee	IRS Security	202-439-9713	lisa.a.lee@irs.gov
X	Andrew	Lewis	DCOP - SHPO	202-442-8841	andrew.lewis@dc.gov
X	Frederick	Lindstrom	CFA	202-504-2200	flindstrom@cfa.gov
X	David	Maloney	DCOP - SHPO	202-442-8850	david.maloney@dc.gov
X	Ellen	McCarthy	ArentFox		
X	Rebecca	Miller	DCPL	202-783-5144	rebecca@dcpreservation.org
X	Dick	Moore	IRS	202-622-0742	Richard.a.moore@irs.gov
X	Murat	Omay	DDOT	202-741-8912	murat.oday@dc.gov
X	David	Orowitz	Trump Org	212-836-3252	dorowitz@trumporg.com
X	Ana	Paden	OLBN		anaf@olbn.com
X	Edwin	Rollins	IRS Security	202-622-5096	edwin.m.rollins@irs.gov
X	Quilla	Roth	WRS	202-244-1658	groth@verizon.net

Old Post Office

Consulting Party Meeting Meeting Notes

July 25, 2012
GSA Regional Office Building
1:30 – 4:00 pm

X	Beth	Savage	GSA		beth.savage@gsa.gov
X	Joshua	Seidner	Trump Org	212-836-3231	jseidner@trumporg.com
X	Kevin	Terry	GSA	202-708-4600	kevin.terry@gsa.gov
X	Tim	Tozer	GSA	202-708-9882	Timothy.tozer@gsa.gov
X	Ivanka	Trump	Trump Org		
X	Andrew	Weiss	Trump Org		aweiss@trumporg.com
X	Nancy	Witherell	GSA	202-260-0663	nancy.witherell@gsa.gov